

**ASSEMBLY COUNCIL**  
**May 4, 2022**

The Assembly Council met by video conference on Wednesday May 4, 2022. S. Cameron Evans, convener, opened the meeting with prayer.

**LAND****ACKNOWLEDGEMENT**

378/22C

The convener acknowledged that The Presbyterian Church in Canada and its members are on the historic territory of the First Nations, Metis and Inuit Peoples of this land. As a church, we take seriously the challenge of reconciliation, to deepen bonds of friendship and solidarity, to strive to “walk together” in the present and future, and to live with integrity the words of Our Confession to God and to Indigenous Peoples from 1994.

**PRESENT**

379/22C

Assembly Appointees: The Rev. Cherie A. Inksetter, Mr. Peter A. Kinch, the Rev. Bethany McCaffery, the Rev. Jeffrey M. Murray, Ms. Ann Paterson, Ms. Barbara Sargent, Ms. Linda Shaw, the Rev. John R. Wilson.

Presbytery Representatives: Ms. Brenda Butler, Ms. Sandra J. Cameron Evans (convener), the Rev. Henry Heung Ryeol Han, the Rev. Jinsook Khang, Ms. Diane Reader Jones, the Rev. Dr. John-Peter C. Smit.

Ex-Officio – Voting: Ms. Cindy Stephenson, Ms. Carol Stymiest.

Ex-Officio – Non-Voting: The Rev. Stephen Kendall (secretary), the Rev. Dr. Ross A. Lockhart, Mr. Oliver Ng, the Rev. Ian Ross-McDonald.

Staff: Ms. Terrie-Lee Hamilton, the Rev. Donald Muir.

**PURPOSE OF MEETING**

381/22C

The Assembly Council met to consider and make decisions concerning the report of the Departures/Alternate Governance Working Group.

**DEPARTURES/  
ALTERNATE  
GOVERNANCE**

**Report**

382/22C

It was moved by P. Kinch, duly seconded and

AGREED, that the report be received and considered.

P. Kinch highlighted the changes made to the appendices from the discussion held at the May 4 meeting.

**Voluntary Withdrawal**

383/22C

**Recommendation No. 1**

It was moved by P. Kinch, duly seconded and

AGREED, to recommend to the General Assembly:

That the proposed approach for congregations wishing to depart from The Presbyterian Church in Canada on a voluntary withdrawal basis and retain a stipulated portion of assets be approved, including determination of the value of church property that may be distributed upon withdrawal and related procedures to effect voluntary withdrawal from The Presbyterian Church in Canada.

384/22C

**Dissent**

Henry Han

385/22C

**Dissent with Reasons**

John Wilson requested that his dissent be recorded, with reasons. Jinsook Khang, Barb Sargent and Linda Shaw requested that their names be added to this dissent. We wish to record our reasons for our dissent to Recommendation No. 1 as follows:

Recommendation No. 1 fails to answer the prayer of the numerous overtures requesting a “gracious” way to leave The Presbyterian Church in Canada because of profound

disagreement with the now adopted Remits. In fact, many of the overtures preceded the Remits themselves.

The original Gracious Dismissal Committee of the Assembly Council proposed in its received report to remove the contentious issue of money from the debate on leaving the denomination. The intent was to have the decision of a congregation be on the theological issues involved in the Remits and not force a congregation's decision to be burdened with the punitive idea of losing their beloved building because of their deeply held convictions on human sexuality. This report has placed money and the church building squarely back in the middle of the consideration and therefore inserts a potential "punitive and manipulative" force into the prayerful and reasoned theological discussion and decision of every congregation.

Secondly, in arriving at the 50 percent number for the consideration of net assets, the report relies on the idea of an assessment by a licensed Realtor as the basis for the determination of value of the property(s) of the congregation. The problem with this is that an assessment by a Realtor does not necessarily equal the final sale value of a property. This leaves congregations unable to accurately assess, within the narrow parameters of their voting window (between November 22, 2022 to May 31, 2023), the real value of their properties and assets.

Thirdly, 50 percent of "other assets" being made payable to The Presbyterian Church in Canada, which includes monies held in trust by the congregation for express purposes, will potentially violate the Revenue Canada rules for monies held in trust. It will force congregations into a potentially illegal situation.

Fourthly, if the consideration of a monetary value "owed" to The Presbyterian Church in Canada (i.e., in the 50 percent building/assets consideration) for past services to the congregation for the training of ministers, etc., is to be fairly considered as a viable option, then surely the amount of money contributed to Presbyterians Sharing, etc., from the congregation to the national church over the years should also be considered. What, therefore, is the apportioned amount that the congregation has given to The Presbyterian Church in Canada over the years (adjusted to inflation) and how may this potentially offset the 50 percent of the building/assets consideration?

**Overtures re Alternate  
Governing Bodies**  
386/22C

**Recommendation No. 2**

It was moved by P. Kinch, duly seconded and

AGREED, to recommend to the General Assembly:  
that Overture Nos. 9, 10, 11, 2020; 1, 10, 12, 16, 17, 18, 20, 21, 22, 23,  
24, 25, 29, 31, 33, 38, 46, 48, 50, 51, 75, 90, 2021 dealing with  
alternate governing bodies, be answered in terms of the above report.

387/22C

**Dissent with reasons**

John Wilson requested that this dissent with reasons be recorded. Jinsook Khang, Barbara Sargent and Linda Shaw requested that their names be added to this dissent.

We wish to record our reasons for our dissent to Recommendation No. 2 of the Assembly Council's report to the General Assembly containing the response to the overtures requesting alternate governing bodies.

Our dissent is principally for the following reason:

The report relies heavily on an inaccurate belief that the matter has previously been debated and considered by The Presbyterian Church in Canada at the 2019 General Assembly.

The report indicates in its third last paragraph that “there appeared to be a lack of support for Pathway C...” and goes on to imply that a reasoned decision of the Assembly was made on the concept. This comment is incorrect. At the time of discussion on the floor of General Assembly, the Assembly was in a Committee of the Whole wherein only “positive” words about one Pathway could be discussed...this did not and does not represent a valid debate of any of the Pathways (and certainly not on the wider concept of alternate governing bodies).

And further, once out of the Committee of the Whole, an immediate vote was called for and allowed, again with no discussion. Therefore The Presbyterian Church in Canada has never had a reasoned, substantive debate as to the merits or demerits of Alternative Governing Bodies.

The matter deserves a considered discussion within the denomination. This report does not adequately answer the question as to why Alternative Governing Bodies cannot be a workable solution for The Presbyterian Church in Canada.

Views of the Minority  
388/22C

**Additional Motion**

It was moved by John Wilson, duly seconded and

DEFEATED that the views of the minority be included in the Assembly Council report.

389/22C

**Dissent**

The following requested that their dissent be recorded: Henry Han, Jinsook Khang, Barb Sargent, Linda Shaw, John Wilson.

**Overtures re Withdrawing  
with Property**  
390/22C

**Recommendation No. 3**

It was moved by P. Kinch, duly seconded and

AGREED, to recommend to the General Assembly:  
That Overture Nos. 2, 6, 10, 11, 12, 14, 15, 17, 18, 20, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29, 2017; 9, 19, 26, 27, 28, 30, 32, 35, 36, 37, 39, 43, 47, 49, 53, 64, 65, 67, 68, 69, 70, 71, 72, 73, 74, 75, 78, 79, 82, 83, 85 and 87, 2021; 8, 10, 2022 dealing with congregations seeking to leave The Presbyterian Church in Canada with church property, be answered in terms of the above report.

391/22C

**Dissent**

The following individuals indicated their dissent: Henry Han, Jinsook Khang, Barb Sargent, Linda Shaw, John Wilson.

**Working Group  
Discharged**  
392/22C

**Recommendation No. 4**

It was moved by P. Kinch, duly seconded and

AGREED, that the working group re Departures/Alternate Governance be dismissed with the rising of the General Assembly.

**Report**  
393/22C

It was moved, duly seconded and

AGREED, that the report as a whole be adopted.

**ADJOURNMENT**  
394/22C

It was moved by C. Stymiest, duly seconded and

AGREED, that the Council adjourn.

The convener closed the meeting with prayer.