

## **SEVENTH SEDERUNT**

### **ASSEMBLY CONSTITUTED**

On Wednesday, June 9, 2021 at 4:00 p.m. (EDT), the Assembly met pursuant to adjournment. The Moderator constituted the Assembly with prayer.

### **COMMITTEE ON CHURCH DOCTRINE**

The Assembly called for the report of the Committee on Church Doctrine which, as printed on p. XXX–XXX, was introduced by W. Hong, convener.

**Omnibus Recommendation CDC-OMB**, that the following recommendations be approved, was moved by C.J. Fensham, duly seconded.

CDC-001 - Overture No. 8, 2018 re recreational use of marijuana, statement received

CDC-002 - Overture No. 8, 2018 re recreational use of marijuana, statement as reply

CDC-003 - Overture No. 30, 2017 re preamble to ordination and induction of ruling elders and Overture No. 11, 2019 re preamble to ordination and induction of ministers

CDC-004 - Physician Assisted Suicide

CDC-005 - Overture No.3, 2020 re affirming the seriousness and sanctity of ordination vows

CDC-006 - Overture No. 3, 2021 re revising Living Faith in light of contemporary language

#### **Amendment**

C.D. Cameron moved, duly seconded that CDC-003 be removed from the omnibus motion. Adopted.

**Omnibus Recommendation CDC-OMB**, as amended, was adopted, thereby approving the following recommendations:

CDC-001 (p. XXX)

CDC-004 (p. XXX)

CDC-006 (p. XXX)

CDC-002 (p. XXX)

CDC-005 (p. XXX)

**Recommendation CDC-003** (p. XXX) was moved by C.J. Fensham, duly seconded. Adopted.

#### **Dissent with Reasons**

Recommendation CDC-OMB: E.M.W. Charlton (p. XXX)

Recommendation CDC-003: E.M.W. Charlton (p. XXX)

(cont'd on p. XXX)

### **COMMITTEE ON BILLS AND OVERTURES**

The Assembly called for the report of the Committee to Bills and Overtures which, as printed on p. XXX–XXX, was introduced by V. Kim, convener.

**Omnibus Recommendation BOV-OMB**, that the following recommendations be approved, was moved by V. Kim, duly seconded.

BOV-001 - Alternative Governing Bodies

BOV-002 - Gracious Dismissal

BOV-003 - Overture Nos. 34, 44, 45, 54, 55 re limiting business of the 2021 Assembly

BOV-004 - Overture No. 40, 2021 re amending Book of Forms 48

BOV-005 - Overture No. 41, 2021 re liberty of conscience and indemnity for possible claims

BOV-006 - Overture No. 42, 2021 re registry of ministers and congregations re solemnizing same-sex marriage

BOV-007 - Overture No. 52, 2021 re drug addiction resources and counselling

BOV-008 - Overture No. 76, 2021 re ensuring open and fair discernment at the General Assembly

BOV-009 - Overture No. 77, 2021 re endorsing Remits B and C, 2019

**Amendment**

B.J.W. Ferrier moved, duly seconded, that BOV-001 be removed from the omnibus motion. Adopted.

**Amendment**

D. Jennings moved, duly seconded, that BOV-002 be removed from the omnibus motion.

**Additional Motion**

J.I.F. Bartlett moved, duly seconded, that speakers allotted time be reduced to one minute and 30 seconds.

**Immediate Vote**

S.G. Currie moved, duly seconded, that the Assembly take an immediate vote on the additional motion. Adopted.

**Additional Motion defeated**

The additional motion was defeated.

**Amendment**

Discussion resumed.

**Immediate Vote**

A. Kay moved, duly seconded, that the Assembly take an immediate vote on the amendment. Adopted.

**Amendment adopted**

The amendment that BOV-002 be removed from the omnibus motion, was adopted.

**Amendment**

A. Thompson moved, duly seconded, that BOV-006 be removed from the omnibus motion. Defeated.

**Amendment**

D. Jennings moved, duly seconded, that BOV-005 be removed from the omnibus motion.

**Immediate Vote**

L. Resende moved, duly seconded, that the Assembly vote immediately on the amendment. Adopted.

**Amendment defeated**

The amendment was defeated.

**Omnibus Recommendation BOV-OMB**, as amended, was adopted, thereby approving the following recommendations:

BOV-003 - (p. XXX)

BOV-006 - (p. XXX)

BOV-009 - (p. XXX)

BOV-004 - (p. XXX)

BOV-007 - (p. XXX)

BOV-005 - (p. XXX)

BOV-008 - (p. XXX)

**Dissent with Reasons**

Recommendation BOV-OMB: E.M.W. Charlton (p. XXX)

Recommendation BOV-005: S.K. Bell, B.J.W. Ferrier (p. XXX)

Recommendation BOV-006: B.J.W. Ferrier (p. XXX)

**Recommendation BOV-011** (p. XXX) was moved by V. Kim, duly seconded. Adopted

**Recommendation BOV-001** (p. XXX) was moved by V. Kim, duly seconded.

**Amendment**

T. Kay moved, duly seconded, that the words “and that the Clerks and Assembly Council be directed to bring forward their response and recommendations to the 2022 General Assembly” follow the words “Clerks of Assembly”. Adopted.

**Recommendation BOV-001**, as amended, was adopted as follows:

That Overture Nos. 22, 23, 24, 25, 29, 31, 33, 38, 46, 48, 50 and 51, 2021 dealing with alternative governing bodies be referred to the Assembly Council in consultation with the Clerks of Assembly and that the Clerks and Assembly Council be directed to bring forward their response and recommendations to the 2022 General Assembly. Adopted.

**Dissent with Reasons**

Recommendation BOV-001: S.K. Bell, B.J.W. Ferrier (p. XXX)

**Recommendation BOV-002** (p. XXX) was moved by V. Kim, duly seconded. Adopted.

**Dissent with Reasons**

Recommendation BOV-002: S.K. Bell, B.J.W. Ferrier, H.H.R. Han, J.W. Kim, D. Krunys, S. Kwon, C. Nam, M. Ryu, S.W. Webb (p. XXX)

**Recommendation BOV-010** was previously adopted. (p. XXX)

(cont'd on p. XXX)

**COMMITTEE TO CONFER WITH THE MODERATOR  
COMMITTEE ON TERMS OF REFERENCE**

The Assembly called for the report of the Committee to Confer with the Moderator and the Committee on Terms of Reference, which was introduced by A. Currie, convener.

**Receive and Consider**

A. Currie moved, duly seconded, that the report of the Committee to Confer with the Moderator and the Committee on Terms of Reference be received and considered. Adopted.

**Consent Recommendation CON-Consent**, that the following recommendations be adopted, was moved by A. Currie, duly seconded. Adopted.

The recommendations adopted by consent are as follows are included in the report below.

CON-001: Committee to Advise with the Moderator

CON-002: Special Committee re Confession to LGBTQI People

CON-003: Special Committee Membership

CON-004: Special Committee re Petitions Nos. 1 and 2, 2021

CON-005: Special Committee Membership

CON-006: Special Commission re Appeal No. 1, 2021 – Terms of Reference

CON-007: Special Commission Membership

**Committee to Advise with the Moderator 2021–2022**

**Recommendation CON-001** (Adopted by consent)

That the Committee to Advise with the Moderator be named as follows: Dr. Tori Smit (convener), Mr. Jim Agnew, the Rev. Linda Park, Ms. Christine Samuel, Mr. Jonathan Scott, the Rev. James Yang, the Rev. S. Kendall (Principal Clerk), Ms. T. Hamilton (Secretary), with the Rev. Dr. Wafik Whaba as a resource person.

**Special Committee Re Confession to LGBTQI People**

Pursuant to the adoption of a Special Committee on Listening (Rainbow Communion) Recommendation RCL-004, the following recommendations are made.

**Recommendation CON-002** (Adopted by consent)

That the terms of reference for the Special Committee Re Confession to LGBTQI people be as follows:

**Terms of Reference**

1. That the Special Committee be made up of six people including a diversity of voices and members of the LGBTQI community.
2. That the Special Committee appoint a convener from among its members.

3. That the Special Committee review the full report of the Special Committee on Listening (Rainbow Communion).
4. That the Special Committee prepare a confession for harm done to LGBTQI people and report to the 2022 General Assembly.

### **Special Committee Membership**

#### **Recommendation CON-003** (Adopted by consent)

That the Special Committee Re Confession to LGBTQI people be named as follows: the Rev. Paulette Brown, Ms. Lela Burt, the Rev. Daniel Cho, the Rev. Dr. Charles Fensham, Mr. David Robinson with the Rev. Andrew Holmes as a resource person.

#### **Special Committee Re Petition Nos. 1 and 2, 2021**

##### **Re: Confession to ethnic contingent of denomination**

That pursuant to the adoption of Bills and Overtures Recommendation BOV-010 re Petition Nos. 1 and 2, 2021, re Confession to ethnic contingent of denomination.

#### **Recommendation CON-004** (Adopted by consent)

That the terms of reference for the Special Committee re Petition Nos. 1 and 2, 2021 be as follows:

##### **Terms of Reference**

1. That the Special Committee be made up of nine people, with the majority of members being described as not belonging to the dominant culture in The Presbyterian Church in Canada.
2. That the Special Committee appoint a convener from among its members.
3. That the Special Committee review Petition Nos. 1 and 2, 2021 and meet with representatives of the Presbytery of Eastern Han-Ca and Western Han-Ca, and others as necessary, to examine the concerns expressed in the petitions.
4. That the Special Committee be authorized to call for documents that are deemed necessary to complete this work.
5. That the Special Committee propose a budget for its work to the Assembly Council.
6. That the Special Committee prepare a report to the 2022 General Assembly.

##### **Dissent with Reasons**

Recommendation CON-004: S.K. Bell (p. XXX)

### **Special Committee Membership**

#### **Recommendation CON-005** (Adopted by consent)

That the Special Committee re Petition Nos 1 and 2, 2021 be named as follows: the Rev. Sampson Afoakwah, the Rev. Peter Bush, the Rev. Mary Fontaine, the Rev. Joon Ki Kim, the Rev. Stephen Kwon, the Rev. Linda Park, the Rev. Dr. Daniel Scott, the Rev. Frank Szatmari, the Rev. Sean Seungho Lee.

#### **Special Commission re Appeal No. 1, 2021**

The Session of Valleyview Presbyterian Church against the decision of the Presbytery of Calgary-MacLeod.

#### **Recommendation CON-006** (Adopted by consent)

That the terms of reference for the Special Commission re Appeal No. 1, 2021 be as follows:

##### **Terms of Reference**

1. The commission is established under the authority of Book of Forms section 290 having all the powers of the General Assembly within its terms of reference.
2. The appellant shall be made aware that the judgment of the commission is final and must be obeyed (Book of Forms section 290.4).
3. The procedures and actions of the commission shall be consistent with the laws of The Presbyterian Church in Canada, in particular, legislation regarding grounds for an appeal (Book of Forms 395) and the principles of procedural fairness.
4. The commission shall be given authority to call for, confirm and examine the judicial record (Book of Forms sections 378 ff) and any other records it deems to be relevant.

5. The commission shall be empowered to review and comment on the process and procedures followed by the Presbytery of Calgary-MacLeod to arrive at its decision.
6. The commission shall be empowered to call before it, by citation, witnesses on behalf of the appellant and the respondent presbytery.
7. The commission shall meet as soon as reasonably possible following the rising of the Assembly and, after its review and judgment, bring the matters to a conclusion with due regard for the best interests of all concerned, and for the peace and harmony of the Church of Jesus Christ.
8. Reasonable expenses for the members of the commission to carry out their work shall be reimbursed according to provided guidelines.
9. The commission shall report its action to the 2022 General Assembly, and shall use, insofar as is possible and appropriate, the following framework: Preamble, Terms of Reference, Membership, Procedures, Findings, Analysis, Decision and Judgment, Pastoral Comment.

**Recommendation CON-007** (Adopted by consent)

That the Special Commission re Appeal No 1, 2021 be named as follows: Ms. Gina Farnell, Ms. Barbara Ferrier, the Rev. Thomas Kay, the Rev. Derek Krunys, and the Rev. Dr. Stuart Macdonald.

(cont'd on p. XXX)

**ASSEMBLY COUNCIL**

The Assembly called for the report of the Assembly Council which, as printed on p. XXX–XXX, was introduced by S. Cameron Evans, convener.

**Omnibus Recommendation ASC-OMB**, that the following recommendations be approved, was moved by S. Cameron Evans, duly seconded.

- ASC-001 - Microfilming of church records
- ASC-002 - Financial Statements December 31, 2019, The Presbyterian Church in Canada
- ASC-003 - Financial statements December 31, 2019, Pension Fund
- ASC-004 - 2021 Budget, homologating approval by Assembly Council
- ASC-005 - Overture No. 5, 2019 re Committee to Nominate Terms of Reference
- ASC-006 - Overture No. 4, 2020 re Information on Legal Implications of Remits B and C, 2019
- ASC-007 - Power to Issue regarding Applications through the Committee on Education and Reception
- ASC-008 - Overture No. 9, 2018 re granting vote for young adult representatives
- ASC-009 - Right to make and second motions
- ASC-010 - Encouraging congregations to elect young people with gifts and calling to the eldership
- ASC-011 - Approving the response to Overture No. 9, 2018
- ASC-012 - Additional Motion, 2019 and Overture No. 2, 2020 re General Assembly Worship Guidelines
- ASC-013 - National Indigenous Ministries Council – Terms of Reference to become a standing committee
- ASC-014 - Minimum Stipend for 2021 – 0% Increase
- ASC-015 - Financial statements December 31, 2020, The Presbyterian Church in Canada
- ASC-016 - Financial statements December 31, 2020, Pension Fund
- ASC-017 - 2022 Budget
- ASC-018 - Three Year Forecast 2023–2025
- ASC-019 - Overture No. 11, 2021 re recording in-person and online weekly attendance
- ASC-020 - Permission to defer responses to overtures requesting governance changes in view of Remits B and C, 2019
- ASC-021 - Overture No. 8, 2021 re limiting the scope of business for the 2021 General Assembly
- ASC-022 - Committee to Nominate Standing Committees – appointing standing committees membership, 2020–2021

**Amendments**

D. Jennings moved, duly seconded that ASC-020 be removed from the omnibus motion. Adopted.

**Omnibus Recommendation ASC-OMB**, as amended, as adopted, thereby approving the following recommendations:

- |                    |                    |                    |
|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| ASC-001 - (p. XXX) | ASC-004 - (p. XXX) | ASC-007 - (p. XXX) |
| ASC-002 - (p. XXX) | ASC-005 - (p. XXX) | ASC-008 - (p. XXX) |
| ASC-003 - (p. XXX) | ASC-006 - (p. XXX) | ASC-009 - (p. XXX) |

ASC-010 - (p. XXX)

ASC-014 - (p. XXX)

ASC-018 - (p. XXX)

ASC-011 - (p. XXX)

ASC-015 - (p. XXX)

ASC-019 - (p. XXX)

ASC-012 - (p. XXX)

ASC-016 - (p. XXX)

ASC-021 - (p. XXX)

ASC-013 - (p. XXX)

ASC-017 - (p. XXX)

ASC-022 - (p. XXX)

**Dissent with Reasons**

Recommendation ASC-OMB: S.K. Bell, E.M.W. Charlton (p. XXX)

Recommendation ASC-017: D. Krunys (p. XXX)

Recommendation ASC-021: D. Krunys (p. XXX)

**Recommendation ASC-020** (p. XXX) was moved by S. Cameron Evans, duly seconded. Adopted.**Dissent with Reasons**

Recommendation ASC-020: E.M.W. Charlton, H.H.R. Han, J.W. Kim, D. Krunys, C. Nam, M. Ryu (p. XXX)

(cont'd p. XXX)

**CLERKS OF ASSEMBLY**

The Assembly called for the report of the Clerks of Assembly which, as printed on p. XXX–XXX, was introduced by the D.G.A. Muir, Deputy Clerk.

**Omnibus Recommendation CLK-OMB**, that the following recommendations be approved, was moved by J. Szostak, duly seconded. Adopted.

CLK-001 - (p. XXX)

CLK-009 - (p. XXX)

CLK-015 - (p. XXX)1

CLK-002 - (p. XXX)

CLK-010 - (p. XXX)

CLK-016 - (p. XXX)

CLK-003 - (p. XXX)

CLK-011 - (p. XXX)

CLK-017 - (p. XXX)

CLK-004 - (p. XXX)

CLK-012 - (p. XXX)

CLK-018 - (p. XXX)

CLK-007 - (p. XXX)

CLK-013 - (p. XXX)

CLK-019 - (p. XXX)

CLK-008 - (p. XXX)

CLK-014 - (p. XXX)

CLK-020 - (p. XXX)

**Dissent with Reasons**

Recommendation CLK-001: J.T. Hurd (p. XXX)

**Recommendation CLK-005** (p. XXX) was moved by J. Szostak, duly seconded. Adopted.**Recommendation CLK-006** (p. XXX) was moved by J. Szostak, duly seconded.**Amendment**

R.N. Faris moved, duly seconded, that Recommendation CLK-006 be amended by removing the word “deleted” and add “revised through a Declaratory Act to read:” (Proposed revisions to Book of Forms 11.2 are bold and underlined) 11.2 The following Declaratory Act was adopted by the 1989 General Assembly and ordered inserted in the Book of Forms (A&P 1981, p. 90; A&P 1989, p. 271, 65) **and was revised through an additional Declaratory Act adopted by the 2021 General Assembly:** By virtue of their ordination vows, all ministers and elders are obliged to exercise full ministry including, among other things, active participation in the ordination of candidates to the eldership and to the ministry of Word and Sacraments. **The one exception is that ministers and elders are granted liberty of conscience and action in active participation in the ordination, induction and installation of candidates to the eldership and to the ministry of Word and Sacraments who are LGBTQI persons (married or single) (Remit C, 2019 A&P . . . .).** Though presbyteries have no authority to grant permission to disobey church law and doctrine, yet they are enjoined to deal with cases of conscience on any question with pastoral care and understanding for the parties involved, with concern and sensitivity for the peace and unity of the whole church.

**Amendment adopted**

The amendment was adopted.

**Recommendation CLK-006** as amended, was adopted as follows:

That Book of Forms section 11.2 be revised through a Declaratory Act to read:

11.2 The following Declaratory Act was adopted by the 1989 General Assembly and ordered inserted in the Book of Forms (A&P 1981, p. 90; A&P 1989, p. 271, 65) and was revised through an additional Declaratory Act adopted by the 2021 General Assembly: By virtue of their ordination vows, all ministers and elders are obliged to exercise full ministry including, among other things, active participation in the ordination of candidates to the eldership and to the ministry of Word and Sacraments. The one exception is that ministers and elders are granted liberty of conscience and action in active participation in the ordination, induction and installation of candidates to the eldership and to the ministry of Word and Sacraments who are LGBTQI persons (married or single). (Remit C, 2019 – A&P 2019, p. 5) Though presbyteries have no authority to grant permission to disobey church law and doctrine, yet they are enjoined to deal with cases of conscience on any question with pastoral care and understanding for the parties involved, with concern and sensitivity for the peace and unity of the whole church.

(cont'd on p. XXX)

### **PENSION AND BENEFITS BOARD**

The Assembly called for the report of the Pension and Benefits Board which, as printed on p. XXX–XXX, was introduced by J.C. Bigelow, convener.

#### **Motion to Reconsider**

D.K. May moved, duly seconded that pursuant to notice of motion (p. XXX), that the constitution of the Pension and Benefits Plan be reconsidered. Adopted.

**Omnibus Recommendation PAB-OMB**, that the following recommendations be approved, was moved by D.K. May, duly seconded.

PAB-001 - Changes in Pension Plan membership status  
PAB-002 - Asset Liability Management (ALM) Study  
PAB-003 - Overture No. 14, 2019 re pension contribution from ecumenical shared ministry congregations  
PAB-004 - Amendments to the Constitution effective January 1, 2022  
PAB-005 - Constitution, amendment to section 7.1  
PAB-006 - Petition No. 1 2021 re reassessment of pension contributions  
PAB-007 - Overture No. 4, 2021 re maternity/paternal leave benefit top-up  
PAB-008 - Overture No. 5, 2021 re health and dental plans for clergy couple in congregation  
PAB-009 - Overture No. 7, 2021 re clergy pay equity and gender-based discrimination, response to  
PAB-010 - Overture No. 7, 2021 re clergy pay equity and gender-based discrimination, data re  
PAB-011 - Overture No. 7, 2021 re clergy pay equity and gender-based discrimination, stipendiary inequities  
PAB-012 - Overture No. 7, 2021 re clergy pay equity and gender-based discrimination, stipendiary comparisons

#### **Amendment**

D.M.K. Stanbury moved, duly seconded that PAB-010, PAB-011, PAB-012 be removed from the omnibus motion. Adopted.

#### **Amendment**

A.J.R. Johnston moved, duly seconded, that PAB-007 and PAB-008 be removed from the omnibus motion. Adopted.

**Omnibus Recommendation LMA-OMB**, as amended, was adopted, thereby approving the following recommendations.

PAB-001 - (p. XXX)	PAB-004 - (p. XXX)	PAB-009 - (p. XXX)
PAB-002 - (p. XXX)	PAB-005 - (p. XXX)	
PAB-003 - (p. XXX)	PAB-006 - (p. XXX)	

#### **Motion to Refer**

A.J.R. Johnston moved, duly seconded, that PAB-007 be referred to Ministry and Church Vocations. Adopted.

#### **Motion to Refer**

A.J.R. Johnston moved, duly seconded, that PAB-008 be referred to Ministry and Church Vocations. Adopted.

**Recommendation PAB-010** (p. XXX) was moved by D.K. May, duly seconded.

**Amendment**

D.M.K. Stanbury moved, duly seconded that Recommendation PAB-010 be amended by deleting “be encouraged to”; adding “on gender” after the word “data”; replacing “within the bounds” with “including, but not limited to, gender, stipend, educational background, years of service, and terms of call”; and adding “and that presbyteries report annually the data on equity to the Assembly Council to assist in the feasibility and achievability needed to conduct stipendiary comparisons.” after the word “exists”. Adopted.

**Recommendation PAB-010**, as amended, was adopted as follows:

That presbyteries collect and analyse data on gender pay equity including, but not limited to, gender, stipend, educational background, years of service, and terms of call and seek to identify and address any situations where gender discrimination exists; and that presbyteries report annually the data on equity the Assembly Council to assist in the feasibility and achievability needed to conduct stipendiary comparisons. Adopted.

**Recommendation PAB-011** (p. XXX) was moved by D.K. May, duly seconded.

**Amendment**

D.M.K. Stanbury moved, duly seconded that the words “be encouraged to” be removed from Recommendation PAB-011. Adopted.

**Recommendation PAB-011**, as amended was adopted as follows:

That, to further assist presbyteries in eliminating stipend inequalities based on gender, presbyteries amend their standing orders such that interim moderators disclose and explain to the appropriate presbytery committee what differences exist between the stipend provided to the last incumbent and the guarantee of stipend in the call to the new minister and why such differences may exist.

**Recommendation PAB-012** (p. XXX) was moved by D.K. May, duly seconded.

**Amendment**

D.M.K. Stanbury moved, duly seconded that Recommendation PAB-012 be amended by replacing “consider the appropriateness, feasibility and achievability of collecting information in the statistical report needed to conduct stipendiary comparisons” with “in its co-ordinating role, set up a committee with appropriate stakeholders, including a cross-section of female clergy, with the mandate to further understand and respond to gender-based discrimination within the church.” Adopted.

**Recommendation PAB-012**, as amended, was adopted as follows:

That the Assembly Council in its co-ordinating role set up a committee with appropriate stakeholders including a cross-section of female clergy, with the mandate to further understand and respond to gender-based discrimination within the church. Adopted.

(cont'd on p. XXX)

**COMMITTEE ON BUSINESS** (cont'd from p. XXX)

**Recommendation BUS-022**, that the following reports without recommendations be adopted, was moved by J.I.F. Barrett, duly seconded. Adopted.

Atlantic Mission Society (p. XXX)

Maclean Estate Committee (p. XXX)

Trustee Board (p. XXX)

Presbyterian Church Building Corporation (p. XXX)

Vancouver School of Theology (p. XXX)

Ecumenical and Interfaith Relations Committee (p. XXX)

(cont'd on p. XXX)



## STUDENT REPRESENTATIVES

The Assembly called for the report of the student representatives. Three students attended the Assembly: Gerald Gallant (Knox College), Enoch Lee, (The Presbyterian College) and Shirley Carleton (Vancouver School of Theology). Two of the students offered verbal reflections to the Assembly. The Moderator expressed thanks to students for their participation in the Assembly.

## YOUNG ADULT REPRESENTATIVES

The Assembly called for the report of the Young Adult Representatives. By way of a slide presentation, four the Young Adult provided a Prayer Report for the Assembly. The prayer was offered in a number of languages and called for unity in a fractured world. The Moderator expressed thanks to the Young Adult Representatives for their participation in the Assembly and wished them God's blessing as they continue their journey of faith.

## COMMITTEE ON BUSINESS (cont'd from p. XXX)

### Commission re Matters Left Uncared for or Omitted

Recommendation BUS-019, that the Commission of Matters Left Uncared For or Omitted, consisting of the Moderator of the 2021 General Assembly and the Clerks of Assembly, be established until the 2022 General Assembly, was moved by J.I.F. Barrett, duly seconded. Adopted.

### Dissent with Reasons

Recommendation BUS-019: S. Kwon (p. XXX)

### Assembly Minutes

**Recommendation BUS-020**, that the that the minutes of the first five sederunts be adopted as presented, subject to correction and that the minutes of the remaining sederunts be taken as read and adopted, was moved by J.I.F. Barrett, duly seconded. Adopted.

### Roll and Leave to Withdraw

**Recommendation BUS-021** that the following decisions regarding commissioners were approved.

J. P. Fagan (Presbytery of Winnipeg) was removed from the roll.

Regrets from R. R. Paquette (Presbytery of Hamilton) were received.

The following were granted leave to withdraw from:

Sederunt 1 – K.T. Summers (East Toronto)

Sederunt 3 – G. Omolida (Assiniboia), A. Penman (Central Alberta)

Sederunt 4 – G. Omolida (Assiniboia), M.I. Chesnutt (Pictou), J. McWaters (Algoma and North Bay)

Sederunt 5 – H.J.H. Botha (Westminster);

Sederunt 6 and/or 7 – D.D.P. Smith (Prince Edward Island), M.I. Chesnutt (Pictou), J.J. Gordon (West Toronto),

G. Omolida (Assiniboia), O (EH) Kim (Grey-Bruce-Maitland), A. Penman (Central Alberta)

### Adoption of Reports

**Recommendation BUS-024**, that the following reports be adopted, was moved by J.I.F. Barrett, duly seconded. Adopted.

Women's Missionary Society (WMS)

Knox College (KNX)

St. Andrew's Hall (SAH)

Presbyterian College (PCO)

Life and Mission Agency Committee (LMA)

Special Committee on Listening – LGBTQI People  
(Rainbow Communion) (RCL)

Committee to Nominate Standing Committees (NOM)

International Affairs Committee (IAF)

Church Doctrine Committee (CDC)

Church History Committee (HIS)

Business Committee (BUS)

Bills and Overtures Committee (BOV)

Committee to Confer with the Moderator (CON)

Assembly Council (ASC)

Clerks of Assembly (CLK)

Committee on Remits (REM)

Pension and Benefits Board (PAB)

**Dissent with Reasons**

Recommendation BUS-024: A.M. Cornell, J. de Groot (p. XXX).

**ADJOURNMENT**

The business being finished and announcements having been made, the Moderator entertained a motion to adjourn. It was moved by R.G. Ball, duly seconded and adopted, that the 146th General Assembly adjourn. The Assembly joined together in worship. The Moderator led the Assembly in prayer and then said: “In the name of the Lord Jesus Christ, the only King and Head of the Church and by the authority of this Assembly, I now dissolve this Assembly and appoint another General Assembly of The Presbyterian Church in Canada to meet on the fifth day of June, in the year of our Lord, two thousand and twenty-two, at a time and place to be determined.”

**DISSENTS – SEDERUNT SEVEN****Recommendation CDC-OMB**

E.M.W. Charlton: This process has circumvented the agreed upon process of the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Canada. We are doing work that needs to have the time to discussed and worked through as a Church. We are not doing justice to the work that has been done or bringing recognition to the changes that we need to be making and hearing the wider impact of this work on the whole denomination.

**Recommendation CDC-003**

E.M.W. Charlton: We are losing the standard that which we are to follow. While we are just sending this down for input, I feel that we should sending a document down that is fulsome not be taking away from the importance and weight of the vows that we are to take.

**Recommendation BOV-OMB**

E.M.W. Charlton: With the creation of this omnibus process has continually limited the work of the General Assembly by tying up the time of the Commissioners and taken away from more fulsome and essential discussion and debate.

**Recommendation BOV-005**

S.K. Bell: I dissent from this decision to not act more immediately on the question of indemnity for those who refuse to conduct same-sex marriages or participate in LGBTQI ordination. When the decision was made to accept remits B and C, those of a minority view were told to ‘trust the church’. This decision leaves all those people open to legal action until the Assembly Council can report back to a future Assembly. This is not care or concern. It does not build trust. It should have been guaranteed immediately for the protection of the minority.

B.J.W. Ferrier: We have passed historic changes to our doctrine which creates legal vulnerabilities – particularly for elders, congregations and presbyteries. We are irresponsible as a General Assembly to not even discuss the ramifications and consider the implications. We are negligent in not caring in this way for those in our church family by offering legal indemnity coverage.

**Recommendation BOV-006**

B.J.W. Ferrier: Creating a registry of which distinguishes between congregations the basis of those who will provide same-sex marriages only further drives a divide within this denomination. The implications of this should at least have been discussed among commissioners.

**Recommendation BOV-001**

S.K. Bell: I strongly disagree with the decision to put off discussion of these important overtures and refer them to committees that will not bring about any action for another year. The church is in a crisis point with the passing of remits B & C and the possibilities for alternative structures need to be made available as soon as possible so that the denomination is not torn apart or abandoned by those who feel betrayed by the decisions.

B.J.W. Ferrier: We owe our Korean brothers and sisters in the Han-Ca presbyteries the courtesy of a clear answer – will we grant their request or not. This is a justice issue that relates to our renunciation of our colonial attitudes. Their petition on racism confronts our lack of listening or responding to their clear requests over the past 5–6 years. Overtures 1 and 75 ask for immediate action by THIS Assembly. It’s time to provide a clear answer in principle for them and others who have respected our process but yearn for this separation. Assembly Council is clearly overloaded and does not have the capacity to address items referred to it in a timely manner. A special committee with clear terms

of reference would be far more effective, as the important work of the church could be spread over the many competent people in the denomination.

**Recommendation BOV-002**

S.K. Bell: I am very distressed that this motion with regard to Gracious Dismissal was not discussed. This is an essential process to be considered if we are to exemplify the attitude of Christ in our dealings with one another. Gracious Dismissal has been considered since 2015 and there is no excuse that after 6 years we are still not prepared to discuss it. A complete report has been ready since Oct 2020. To defer this conversation is irresponsible and shows no love or compassion for those who find themselves at odds with the new doctrine of the church. In this way, the refusal to deal with Gracious Dismissal smacks of colonialism as the majority wields financial and legal power over the minority, including most of our non-Anglo congregations. This discussion is long overdue and seems to be a stall tactic to avoid acknowledging the harm done to members and congregations that hold a traditional theological viewpoint.

B.J.W. Ferrier: Overtures regarding Gracious Dismissal have been referred to Assembly Council since 2016 and Assembly has yet to receive recommendations to answer those. Assembly Council has had years to address this issue and we have yet to receive a report, much less recommendations from Assembly Council on these matters. Assembly Council has already had significant time to address overtures on this subject and seems to not to have had the bandwidth or the will to address the cry of significant portion of the church. Perhaps Assembly Council is overloaded. It was high time for General Assembly itself to speak to this issue. I urge the church to think more in terms of the Kingdom of God, rather than acting in a self-serving, controlling manner in thinking through ways that we could bless one another, if some feel called by God to pursue other paths or affiliations in doing ministry in Jesus name.

H.H.R. Han: After it was removed from the omnibus agenda, we moved to vote on BOV-002 and ASC-020 right away. The moderator did not even give us a chance to seek recognition or consider a motion that was put up. This is gross injustice.

J.W. Kim: After it was removed from the omnibus agenda, we moved to vote on BOV-002 and ASC-020 right away. The moderator did not even give us a chance to seek recognition or consider a motion that was put up. This is gross injustice.

D. Krunys: The process failed to take place. A motion was visible and ignored. Failure to leave time for good governance because of poorly signed contracts is not acceptable.

S. Kwon: The moderator skipped points of order, questions, AND motions, and went straight to vote without dealing with any of these questions. This is highly out of order. The Assembly chose to pull it out of the omnibus recommendation in ORDER to discuss it, and while there were no one speaking for or against it, additional motions and questions were not given ample consideration.

C. Nam: After it was removed from the omnibus agenda, we moved to vote on BOV-002 and ASC-020 right away. The moderator did not even give us a chance to seek recognition or consider a motion that was put up.

M. Ryu: The Moderator did not give us opportunity to seek recognition or consider a motion.

S.W. Webb: I want to admit that at the end of the fifth sederunt I was quite upset but had a problem trying to figure out why. It wasn't the outcome of votes, it wasn't that the theology and practice of the Church I have given my life to serving changed at the casting of a few votes. There was something else that ran deeper. In sharing my prayer with God it became clearer. It was that the church I served was about to be split. I am not sure it was exactly 30 seconds after the vote on Remit C that the next motion was made but it was almost immediate that the church showed the fear of not following the continual illumination of the Holy Spirit. I realize that these debates having been taking place for some time, but we are back here again today. This is where my anxiety was coming from. Are we so convinced that the Church cannot be reformed that we move forward in fear instead of Joy. We may yet need to make changes to what and how we do things but can we try to work together as a united body of Christ as we allow the Holy Spirit to lead us on from here.

**Recommendation CON-004**

S.K. Bell: While I appreciate many of the terms of this committee, I dissent from the timeline. The petitions specifically asked for immediate response this year at this GA and that voice has been ignored. Too often we have

pushed aside the voices of our cultural minorities in the church and acted paternalistically to their concerns and prophetic voices. To put off this response once again makes us guilty of condescension. I am grieved.

**Recommendation ASC-OMB**

S.K. Bell: I strongly dissent from the omnibus bill as there are many items in this list that if we are to be responsible to the whole church, we MUST discuss. We should not be passing a budget of millions of dollars without any discussion. This applies to so many other recommendations. It makes a farce of the General Assembly. I feel that this is a failure of our process as we have not been following our own polity.

E.M.W. Charlton: With the creation of this omnibus process has continually limited the work of the General Assembly by tying up the time of the Commissioners and taken away from more fulsome and essential discussion and debate. The Presbyterian Church in Canada's General Assembly is more than just a handful of issues. We are called to help with the life of the Church, of the Congregations, Presbyteries, Synods, Camps, and people. We have so much more work that needs to be done. I have missed the opportunity to hear the fulsome debate from all of my siblings in Christ.

**Recommendation ASC-017**

D. Krunys: In 2019 our church held \$91 million in investments, \$103 million in 2019, and \$119 million in 2020 – a \$28 million increase in retained earnings. Are we a bank? This over years when congregations laid off musicians, administrators, and at times severed ties due to financial constraints. We have been adding to our reserves and asking congregations to try and give more. We could expend from only our earning to cover the entirety of our budget, and have left over to support struggling congregations. This is outrageous.

**Recommendation ASC-021**

D. Krunys: Assembly Council was warned by several Presbyteries that time to discuss all matters with any diligence would be problematic. Proceeding with a plan to experiment with an on-line forum over 3 days of meeting was ill advised to say the least. Given the possibility nothing would be deferred, sufficient time to deal with the business properly should have been built into the proposed agenda. Finding a third of commissioners silenced for weighty matters, while slowing down to discuss items with near 100% support was a failure in planning.

**Recommendation ASC-020**

E.M.W. Charlton: I have concerns that we are continually rushing through this Assembly instead of working through the issues at hand. Assembly Council was tasked with bringing recommendations to the General Assembly, but we also as the General Assembly need to be dealing with the work of the Assembly. We have been commissioned to be here yet I feel like we are being rushed through to the other end. The program PC-Biz that is supposed to help, has been a hinderance that seems to have led to confusion.

H.H.R. Han: After it was removed from the omnibus agenda, we moved to vote on BOV-002 and ASC-020 right away. The moderator did not even give us a chance to seek recognition or consider a motion that was put up. This is gross injustice.

J.W. Kim: After it was removed from the omnibus agenda, we moved to vote on BOV-002 and ASC-020 right away. The moderator did not even give us a chance to seek recognition or consider a motion that was put up. This is gross injustice.

D. Krunys: We seem to have decided we will not bother hearing even one amendment prior to voting. This is not the Presbyterian church I love. Successive amendments to slightly alter the same effect are one thing. Not even hearing one is another.

C. Nam: After it was removed from the omnibus agenda, we moved to vote on BOV-002 and ASC-020 right away. The moderator did not even give us a chance to seek recognition or consider a motion that was put up.

M. Ryu: The Moderator did not give us opportunity to seek recognition or consider a motion.

**Recommendation CLK-001**

J.T. Hurd: The assertion in the report of the Clerks of Assembly offered in support of recommendation CLK-001 proposing the deletion of section 8.1 of The Book of Forms stating that "The first sentence of section 91 declares a principle that must be applied to all other questions about dissent. Only those who vote on a question are entitled to a recorded dissent." is in error. It is not true. The historical polity of both the Church of Scotland and the Free Church of Scotland as the antecedents to our polity clearly state otherwise. "Any member of court" may dissent (So states

"Forms of Procedure in the Church Courts of Scotland, 1838) and "A member who ... absent with ... cause, or ... attending a meeting of an inferior Court ... may afterwards have ... dissent ... recorded." (Manual of Practice and Procedure in the United Free Church of Scotland, 1927). (This latter quotation is from a copy of same gifted by Stuart Parker to T. Wardlaw Taylor, Clerk of Assembly, The Presbyterian Church in Canada, inscribed Oct. 1926 prior to his draft of the 1933 edition of The Book of Forms.) An amendment to CLK-001 proposing that section 8.1 remain unchanged and instead the former section 12.1 be restored was submitted to the court but not called by the moderator for consideration. The right to dissent is foundational to our polity and the adoption of the report of the clerks of Assembly fails to ensure it is accurately and robustly respected.

#### **Recommendation BUS-019**

S. Kwon: The General Assembly should have been afforded the time to consider all business with the appropriate care and consideration as is our responsibility as the highest court in the PCC

#### **Recommendation BUS-024**

A.M. Cornell: I had two carefully prepared motions which were not introduced to the court. One was researched written several weeks in advance. Both are time sensitive and cannot wait to be introduced to the 2022 Assembly by overture, as suggested by the clerk.

J. de Groot: The work of this Assembly is not finished therefore in good conscience I cannot agree to this motion.

#### **Motion to Adjourn**

A.M. Cornell: Too many items of business were left undone. Assembly Council should have prepared for the possibility that an extension might have been necessary.

B.J.W. Ferrier: Not nearly enough time was allotted to a General Assembly which was attempting to handle two year's business in two short sederunts per day. It was irresponsible to set up a context that was bound to gloss over issues of tremendous importance to the denomination. Since we were online, the denomination was spared expense of transporting, housing and feeding commissioners, it was absolutely appropriate to plan from the outset at least two additional days of meetings. As such the court was adjourned prematurely. It is disrespectful of commissioners' extensive preparation time that so much business of the court was left to be sent off to committee rather than being dealt with by commissioners. Clearly Assembly Council is overloaded, given that they have met more frequently since Covid began, and yet have been unable to provide answers on matters it was charged to address since 2015 (Gracious Dismissal) and 2018 (theologically separate structures). So it was irresponsible to not structure GA to provide the time to do the business before us.

J.T. Hurd: To the motion to adjourn this the 146th General Assembly, I wish to register and record my dissent for the reasons that this Assembly has not completed its work, and has resolved to adjourn without making adequate provision for its completion, and further has failed to give opportunity for the presentation of commissioners' overtures duly submitted, has not addressed many motions prepared and advanced by commissioners, which failure has led to disregard for the polity and procedure of the church.

D. Krunys: While I am pleased we dealt with an issue of substance, providing sufficient time to openly speak to it for the first time in years, I am disheartened that a decision was made to then gloss over other substantial business though a predetermined limit to our times of meetings. If we were unable to properly consider the business of the court, it should have been deferred, not rushed through without any substantial discussion. My dissent is related to how this end point has damaged the proper and lawful oversight of the affairs of the church.

S. Kwon: This General Assembly has been an incredible failure in the process. It was not an Assembly which furthered unity or trust. The online platform, the virtual assembly, the process, the timing and schedule, has served to handicap the business of the church. This is not the way the highest court of the church should conduct its business.

#### **POSTLUDE**

Concluding postludes were provided by Calvin, Toronto and Briarwood, Beaconsfield.